Final report:

Evaluation of the Bandrum pilot project

August 2019

Submitted by:
Ruth Stevenson

www.ruthlessresearch.co.uk
Contents

Executive summary.................................................................................................................................................. 3

The context for this evaluation .............................................................................................................................. 5
  Background.......................................................................................................................................................... 5
  Methodology...................................................................................................................................................... 5

Delivery of the Bandrum pilot project .................................................................................................................. 6
Response to the Bandrum pilot project .................................................................................................................. 8
Evaluating the project process ............................................................................................................................... 12
Reflecting on the pilot.............................................................................................................................................. 12
Progress against aims and outcomes .................................................................................................................... 13
The legacy of the pilot............................................................................................................................................. 15

Summary and conclusions ..................................................................................................................................... 19

About Ruthless Research

Ruthless Research is an Edinburgh-based independent research consultancy, through which Ruth Stevenson provides a range of qualitative and quantitative research solutions to organisations who work for the benefit of the community.

Contact Ruth Stevenson

Phone: 07884 023 781
Email: ruth@ruthlessresearch.co.uk
Website: www.ruthlessresearch.co.uk
Executive summary

Background

Scottish Care and Luminate wanted to distil learning gained from an extended artist residency run by Luminate in partnership with Erskine Care Homes, and to explore whether this could inform the development of shorter arts in care projects.

This led to a pilot project which was delivered at Bandrum Nursing Home in Fife, by artist Fiona Hermse, in early 2019.

About the project partners

- **Luminate** is Scotland's creative ageing organisation, running a diverse programme of creative events and activities throughout the year ([https://www.luminatescotland.org/](https://www.luminatescotland.org/))
- **Scottish Care** is a membership organisation representing the largest group of independent sector health & social care providers across Scotland ([http://www.scottishcare.org/](http://www.scottishcare.org/))
- **Bandrum Nursing Home** in Saline, Dunfermline, provides specialist nursing care for adults including older people ([https://www.bandrum.co.uk/](https://www.bandrum.co.uk/))

Methodology

The independent evaluation (conducted by Ruthless Research) comprised consultation with the artist and care home staff via session observation forms and telephone depth interviews. At the close of the project, a final meeting was held between key project stakeholders to reflect on the pilot. The evaluation focused on the model of working used during the pilot and the extent to which this was useful and successful.

Summary of the model used

The artists working at Erskine had benefitted from the opportunity to have an extended induction period, and from working in the care homes over full days. The pilot tested what would happen if an induction process and full day visits were implemented in a short project. The features of the model were:

- Bandrum staff were able to spend time with the artist in advance;
- The artist spent full days in the care home, and worked around Bandrum’s daily routines;
- The artist mainly worked in visible spaces within Bandrum;
- The artist was allowed time to get to know the residents;
- The artist had the freedom to try different approaches;
- Various members of Bandrum staff were encouraged to get involved;
- The residency comprised group and one-to-one artwork sessions;
- The project length was two days of induction and nine days of residency;
- The pilot culminated in an exhibition.
The impacts of the pilot project

The pilot project was recognised to have had a positive impact:

- The residents themselves demonstrated their enjoyment of the activities and produced some creative work which was shown in an exhibition.
- Staff members learned a lot from the artist and are expanding their creative practice.
- Bandrum’s management were positive about the experience, and continue to employ the artist after the pilot finished.

As well as the immediate impact of the work it is notable that Bandrum staff have organically grown their creative provision as a direct result of this pilot project aptly demonstrating the value that they place on what was achieved.

Conclusions

This was a successful pilot project and the model could certainly be replicated elsewhere. The approach worked well because of the time and flexibility that the artist was given which allowed her to get to know individuals on their own terms and work within the routine of the care setting. As a consequence, residents were able to engage in a meaningful way and staff members were inspired to take a more creative approach in their own practice. Care settings are busy places with a lot of practical routine, and this model would not have worked if the care home management had not been supportive, or if the artist was always felt to be getting in the way. For this reason, it was important that early induction sessions took place and that the artist took active measures to form relationships with staff members and be responsive to the needs of the home.

Recommendations for future work

The commissioning body should select an appropriate artist, who:

- Has excellent technical skills.
- Is experienced in working with older people and people living with dementia.
- Is able to work independently, flexibly, and quickly form new relationships.
- Is enthusiastic to take an experimental ‘trial and error’ approach, using creative and reflective methods.

The Care Home should be receptive to the proposed approach:

- Management must be supportive.
- The artist must be given access to the building and residents.
- Staff must be given permission to participate as part of their working day.

The artist should be:

- Tasked with understanding and fitting around the routine of the care setting.
- Given autonomy and allocated time to pursue creative and relationship-building tasks as they see fit.
The context for this evaluation

Background

Scottish Care and Luminate have an ongoing working relationship and both organisations were keen to collaborate on a project exploring new ways of working in Scottish care settings.

Luminate has been working in partnership with Erskine - Scotland’s foremost provider of care for veterans and their spouses - on a 3-year artist-in-residence programme in Erskine’s four care homes; this is part of Unforgotten Forces, a partnership of 16 charities supporting older veterans across Scotland. Resident artists James Winnett and Gill White spend two days each week collaborating with Erskine residents on a wide range of creative activities. The extended length of the residency gives James and Gill the opportunity to build a very strong relationship with Erskine residents and staff, and enables them to design activities that are personalised for each individual they are working with.

As a result of this successful extended artist residency with Erskine, Luminate has identified ways of working that are particularly impactful when working with people living with dementia. This learning has been distilled and a model developed to explore whether this way of working can inform shorter arts in care projects.

A pilot project utilising this model was delivered at Bandrum Nursing Home in Fife, by artist Fiona Hermse.

Methodology

Independent researcher Ruth Stevenson of Ruthless Research was commissioned to evaluate the Bandrum pilot project. The evaluation focuses on the model of working used during the pilot and the extent to which this was useful and successful.

The methodology for the evaluation comprised collecting and/or collating data from the following sources:

- Observation forms completed by the artist and members of care home staff following each session;
- Telephone depth interviews with the artist and three members of care home staff working in different roles;
- Observation of the end of project exhibition;
- Internal project plans and documentation.

At the close of the project, a final meeting was held between key project stakeholders to reflect on the pilot.

All of the data from the various components of the evaluation was collated and analysed, and the findings are provided in the following report.
## Delivery of the Bandrum pilot project

The following table outlines the Bandrum pilot project model, as described using the original Objectives and Outputs of the project:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Outputs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To deliver a creative arts project in a care home engaging residents, staff and visitors through a short residency model.</td>
<td>▪ Short residency project takes place across autumn / spring 2018/19.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| To deliver an induction before the project starts which (1) enables the lead artist to spend time in the care home getting to know staff and residents, and (2) provides a short creative session for staff on each visit, to share his/her approach. | ▪ Artist spends minimum of 2 days in the care home before designing and delivering activities with residents.  
▪ Staff take part in 2 short creative sessions led by the artist before the project starts. |
| To deliver a 9-day residency in the care home.                            | ▪ Artist will spend 9 full days in the care home, anticipated to take place across 9 weeks.  
▪ Artist will mainly work in a visible space(s) enabling residents, visitors and staff to engage on their own terms.  
▪ On each of the 9 days, a short group activity will also be delivered by the artist.  
▪ As the residency progresses and relationships develop, some one-to-one activities will be designed for some residents. |
| To share the resulting creative work with residents, family, friends and staff | ▪ Project will create artistic work that can be shared.  
▪ Family and friends will be invited to attend a sharing at the end of the project. |
| To evaluate the impact of the project and share the findings             | ▪ Evaluator will assess the impact of the project against the defined outcomes and outputs. |

This model was successfully delivered as planned during the early months of 2019.
Response to the Bandrum pilot project

Overall the various people involved with the Bandrum pilot project felt that it was a very positive experience, saying that it was “brilliant”, “a great idea”, that it “worked extremely well” and that it had been “very beneficial to the residents.” The key impacts of the project are described in the following section.

Impact on residents

She loves it, she can’t wait to get out of bed on the morning. The first thing I’d hear when I come in of a morning was “I’ve got the art thing!”

The staff members commented that the residents enjoyed taking part in the art activities. They noted that residents were “relaxed and focused” during the activity, and “uplifted” afterwards. In the dementia unit in particular, the art activities prompted a greater than usual level of smiling and conversation and some of the residents that did not usually engage chose to take part.

As well as artistic outputs, examples of ways that some of the residents engaged include:

- “She spoke about birds, prompted by the feathers.”
- “From reading her notes I knew a lady had spent some of her life in India, so I brought in things from there every week. She would handle them and it seemed obvious that she was interested and had handled similar things in the past. The eye contact and interaction, where previously it had been difficult. It seemed to bring her personality out.”
- “She engaged with buttons for some time, stacking and sorting them. Touched surface of hema beads a little.”
- “After some support to thread cord onto needles. They all were able to independently thread beads and did so very quickly.”
- “He continued to use his building blocks I had brought in previously, I heard from support staff that he uses them on a very regular basis.”

Impact on Bandrum

If residents have been engaged in something they get enjoyment from, their stress levels reduce. They become calmer. It is good for the residents and the staff.

The Managers at Bandrum commented that it was positive to be able to provide activities that were engaging for the residents, as this improved the atmosphere for all. Following residency days staff noticed a positive impact on the mood of residents which enabled them to complete evening tasks with more ease. It was also noted that such activities were attractive for potential new residents and their families.
Impact on staff

The staff members (including care staff, Activity Co-ordinators and Managers) described how much they enjoyed working with the artist. It was also noted that cleaning and reception staff engaged to a certain extent, and showed enthusiasm for the pilot. The various staff members reported having a good laugh together with the artist and residents and appreciated the opportunity to try new things, especially as several did not know a lot about art before. Seeing this work delivered sparked ideas and showed staff new ways to engage with the residents, in some cases changing perspectives on what might be appropriate and achievable. Several staff members reported that they had grown in confidence as a result of the experience because they had been able to learn a lot about techniques and practicalities of delivering creative work. As a consequence they now intended to integrate more creative activities at Bandrum and had already started to do so.

The longer-term impact

The staff were doing craft projects alongside the ones I had been doing.

The pilot inspired the staff and residents to initiate further creative activities, including:

- Hanging artwork in residents’ rooms.
- One resident continuing to regularly use building blocks introduced during a session.
- One resident using stamps and ink with her visiting sister.
- One visitor commenting that it was “nice to do something practical” with the resident as “it takes the pressure off having to make conversation all the time”.
- Staff introducing a regular art project and occasional art competitions for residents.

The artist has been commissioned to continue residency work at Bandrum, and with more confidence in their own creative skills Bandrum has turned down a different workshop opportunity that was offered, distinguishing clearly between activities that staff can deliver themselves and an external artistic input offering the greatest impact for residents and staff.

Impact on the artist

It feels good to be part of an experiment, it encouraged me to try things more. It was OK to fail and just keep trying rather than just deliver all the time.

The artist relished working on a pilot, and in particular being allowed the autonomy to try new things and to get to know people rather than simply delivering workshops.
Evaluating the project process

The following section discusses the component parts of the Bandrum pilot project model.

Bandrum staff were able to meet the artist in advance

At the start of the pilot the artist led two introductory creative sessions for the staff, to introduce herself and the project.

For the artist, these sessions were useful to enable her to meet the various people that worked at Bandrum and start to form relationships with them. The artist and staff were able to discuss some of the practicalities and make mutually agreeable forward plans. Being a “familiar face” was useful during the remainder of the pilot, making it easier for the artist to ask for help and advice. It was felt that the induction sessions worked well because they were informal and activity-based which encouraged staff to engage and eased the reservations that some staff had about what the ‘art’ might be like and their own skill levels.

A member of staff commented that one introductory session might have been sufficient.

The artist worked around Bandrum’s daily routines

The artist understood that she needed to work around the daily routines of the care setting. Managers reinforced that care staff were busy and had many practical responsibilities which needed to be their priority, and the artist was shown some training videos to educate her about health and hygiene procedures along with the various other things that happen in a care setting each day. Specifically at Bandrum, the staff rota changes each fortnight so the artist needed to get to know two teams and two ways of doing things.

The artist did her best to work flexibly, responsively and to use her own initiative so that she could fit around the daily routines without causing disruption. She understood that certain things must happen at certain times, and that this could affect the needs and availability of both residents and staff. Across the course of the pilot the artist was able to assimilate with the Bandrum routine and later actively incorporate it into the residency. This meant that relationships between the artist and staff remained productive, that time was managed in such a way that routines were not disrupted and residents were invited to participate at times when they were most likely to engage, and that consequently the residents got the most out of the sessions.
The artist mainly worked in visible spaces within Bandrum

During the pilot the artist mainly worked in visible spaces around Bandrum so that residents, visitors and staff could engage on their own terms. In the first instance the sessions were held around the dementia unit at Meadow View but this was later extended to include Hilltop View for frail older people. Finding an appropriate space to use was the main challenge of the pilot as it was difficult to find somewhere that was suitable for the art work but was not disruptive to the care routine. The conservatory was tried but found to be distracting as it was a thoroughfare, and the dining room was tried but everything needed to be cleared away for meals. The common room worked best.

The artist was allowed time to get to know the residents

Instead of simply delivering group workshops, the artist was allocated time to get to know the residents. This included spending time with individuals to find out what their backgrounds and hobbies were, reading individual resident support plans, and speaking to staff members and relatives about what might interest individuals. The artist then developed targeted activities around this, bringing in materials and introducing topics and activities that would be of interest to individuals. This resulted in a good degree of engagement amongst residents who did not typically join in activities or even communicate. This also enabled the residents to become comfortable with the artist, which encouraged them to engage with the activities. This worked particularly well for those living with dementia as the artist and resident achieved a degree of familiarity with one another. The staff members praised how flexible and adaptable the artist was in getting people involved and spending time with them. They noted that they are often very busy undertaking practical tasks and may not have the time to do this themselves.

The artist had the freedom to try different approaches

I have found it difficult to engage him, but he was beginning to show a little more interest in what we were up to today than he has in the past. I planned to very gradually build on this, and hopefully get him involved in an activity.
The artist had the freedom to explore different ways of working with individuals. Sometimes these worked, and sometimes they did not. Challenges included residents being confused, vocal, hard to understand, sleepy, or distressed. On one occasion a resident put the art materials in their mouth, and on another a resident poured coffee into the art materials. The artist needed to work around these challenges and determine when it was helpful to pursue activities with specific individuals or not. However, this approach resulted in learning for the artist and staff, and often led to more effective solutions and approaches being discovered.

**Various members of Bandrum staff were encouraged to get involved**

> I've had people come in and do stuff but we didn’t see how they interacted and if the resident wanted to continue it well the staff can’t continue it. But what Fiona gave me, I can continue that.

Staff members from a variety of job functions were keen to get involved with the residency, and were described as “supportive”, “excited” and “eager”. Their active participation made for an enjoyable “community” atmosphere which was fun for all and reinforced bonds between staff and residents. The artist appreciated the support of the staff as this enabled her to involve more residents in the activities, and their hands-on involvement meant that individual needs could be properly supported and more ambitious activities attempted.

The artist found that having staff involved allowed her to ask them a bit more about the residents’ lives, how best to engage with individuals, and take feedback on how activities had been received - furthering her ability to tailor her approach. She also noted that giving the staff members first-hand experience of how well the activities worked for residents was positive because it prompted them to see the value in the activity and want to do more. By the end of the pilot, the staff members were regularly asking the artist for information that would enable them to continue the art work outwith the residency such as how to use particular techniques and where to buy materials.

**The total length of the residency was nine days over nine weeks**

> I think eight weeks is good, then you can have a break in between. That is good then you can come back again and they’ve missed it and are keen to start again. Because eventually it might just become complacent, like an expectation, it will become stale. You don’t want it to become regimental, part of the routine. Because care homes are a bit regimental.

The artist felt that a residency running for nine days over nine weeks had been a good length of time to trial the model. The artist noted that it took a number of weeks to get to know the people and the routine, and that delivery became smoother and more impactful
as time went on. It made a difference to be a “familiar face” for staff and residents. A shorter period would thus work less well. The staff at Bandrum felt strongly that running activities in short blocks of around this length was “optimal” so that residents do not lose interest. However, they would be keen to reintroduce the same activity again after a break.

The pilot culminated in an exhibition

It was really positive, especially from the point of view of the relatives to see what had been achieved by their relatives. And it gave the residents a sense of achievement to see their work displayed.

The pilot culminated in an exhibition of the residents’ work, displayed in the café. This event was appreciated by all, as a celebration of the project - something to work towards and a nice way to finish. The staff described how excited and proud the residents had been to attend the exhibition and see their own work on display. The exhibition was attended by several relatives and the staff commented that it had been particularly positive for them to see what had been achieved and how engaged the residents were.

Overall reflections on taking this approach

In the mornings she did a workshop with a group of people, and in the afternoons she took one to one sessions. There was a need for both so that worked really well.

Overall, the staff members felt that taking this approach worked very well. They felt that the approach had allowed for a good degree of flexibility to experiment with different methods of delivery to fit around the residents and the practicalities of Bandrum, and that working both in groups and one-to-one was useful.

Response to the artist

Nobody said “oh it’s her again”, she was very popular. I only heard good things. The success of the project is entirely related to Fiona’s skill set. She is very gentle, very talented and very skilled.

Several members of staff spontaneously praised the artist, saying that she was “calm”, “gentle”, “flexible”, “responsive” and “easy to talk to” as well as being artistically skilled and able to take the initiative. This helped to create an atmosphere conducive to engagement for the residents, and this helped staff members to feel comfortable asking questions and getting involved. It was noted that “she managed to ‘do with’, not ‘do to’.”
Reflecting on the pilot

At the close of the project, a final meeting was held between key project stakeholders to reflect on the pilot.

The importance of selecting the right artist

The stakeholders felt strongly that the success of the project had been heavily influenced by the creative and inter-personal skills of the artist, and her enthusiasm to embrace the mindset of working on a pilot. Luminate noted that they will use this pilot as an opportunity to review their artist recruitment processes.

The importance of the induction

The stakeholders felt that the induction sessions were very important so that everyone could get to know one-another and start to build vital relationships. Luminate noted that they will explain the benefits of this in more detail when setting up future projects.

The importance of blocks of sessions with gaps

The stakeholders felt that running blocks of sessions followed by a short gap worked well for them. Each block would need to be several weeks long to ensure that relationships could be built up, but then a gap ensured that the activity did not become too routine. Luminate noted that they will take this into consideration when programming future initiatives.

Appreciation for the residency approach

At the close of the pilot, the Managers at Bandrum recognised the value of the residency model as compared to a workshop-based approach.
Progress against aims and outcomes

The following section outlines the progress made against the original aims and outcomes set for the Bandrum pilot project.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aim 1</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To explore the impact of a residency model on a short, artist-led project in a care home.</td>
<td>▪ Project partners increase their understanding of the potential of the residency approach within a short project.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Bandrum pilot project delivered a variety of creative activities using a residency model over only nine working days in the home, but this was recognised to have had a positive impact on the residents and the staff:

▪ The residents themselves demonstrated their enjoyment of the activities and produced some creative work which was shown in an exhibition.
▪ Staff members learned a lot from the artist and are expanding their creative practice.
▪ Bandrum’s management were positive about the experience, and continue to employ the artist after the pilot finished.

As well as the immediate impact of the work it is notable that Bandrum staff have organically grown their creative provision as a direct result of this pilot project aptly demonstrating the value that they place on what was achieved.

Bandrum staff also agreed that the short-term block of sessions worked very well in the care home environment as it ensured that activities did not become too routine. Ideally, a block of around eight weeks would be followed by a gap and then re-introduced.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aim 2</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To explore the impact of the inclusion of induction time for the artist and care staff before work with the residents begins.</td>
<td>▪ Project partners increase their understanding of the development needs of the artist and care professionals to ensure successful project delivery.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The induction sessions were an important part of the pilot. These sessions enabled the artist and care home staff to get to know one another, essential if they were to build relationships and smoothly fit around one another. In the first instance the induction sessions enabled the transfer of practical knowledge about the needs of the artist and the needs of the care home. They also proved to be a warm and gentle introduction to art for staff members who lacked creative confidence or were wary about the practicalities of implementation. The induction sessions also set the tone for the rest of the project as they encouraged a collegiate and collaborative dynamic which enabled the artist and staff to work with each other and ultimately learn from one another ongoing. The pilot would not have been successful without the buy-in of staff, so this was an essential part of the model.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aim 3</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| To increase the confidence, skills and knowledge of the professionals leading the project. | ▪ Care home staff gain confidence and skills in engaging with and sustaining high quality arts activities.  
▪ Artist increases skills and understanding needed to lead impactful arts projects in care settings.  
▪ All project partners increase their understanding of the benefits of creative opportunities to the delivery of person-centred care. |

Several staff members said that they came to the pilot with low levels of confidence around delivering creative activities. However, through observing the artist and participating alongside residents the staff members built capacity around artistic and delivery techniques and were encouraged by the artistic outputs and enjoyment achieved. Plans for staff and residents to continue to work in a creative way have arisen organically alongside the pilot, with plans for this to be ongoing.

The artist appreciated being given the freedom to experiment, and through this she achieved great successes as well as encountering challenges and dead ends. However it was this experimentation that led to the ultimate success of the project for individuals and for Bandrum.

The residents enjoyed the pilot project and many engaged in ways that went beyond what might have otherwise have been anticipated. This was achieved because the artist took a person-centred approach to delivering activities that would be enjoyable and meaningful for individuals. Although this took time and some trial and error, the impacts have been noted and appreciated which has encouraged all project partners to continue to experiment with new person-centred ways of working.

**The legacy of the pilot**

The legacy of the pilot project at Bandrum includes:

▪ The artist has been employed directly by Bandrum to run several more blocks of sessions taking a residency approach.
▪ Bandrum Managers have actively turned down opportunities to buy in creative activities because they felt they could lead similar activities themselves.
▪ Care staff have instigated a number of themed creative activities and setting-wide competitions.
▪ Photos from the pilot have been used in Bandrum publicity brochures and shared on social media.
Summary and conclusions

At the close of the pilot and the evaluation, those involved with the project agreed that it had been worthwhile for the residents and that the model of delivery had worked well.

This was thus a successful pilot project and the model could certainly be replicated elsewhere.

In summary, this approach worked well because of the time and flexibility that the artist was given which allowed her to get to know individuals on their own terms and work within the routine of the care setting. As a consequence residents were able to engage in a meaningful way and staff members were inspired to take a more creative approach in their own practice.

Care settings are busy places with a lot of practical routine, and this model would not have worked if the care home management had not been supportive, or if the artist was always felt to be getting in the way. For this reason, it was important that early induction sessions took place and that the artist took active measures to form relationships with staff members and be responsive to the needs of the home.

In order for a project like this to work...

The commissioning body should select an appropriate artist, who:

- Has excellent technical skills.
- Is experienced in working with older people and people living with dementia.
- Is able to work independently and flexibly.
- Is able to quickly form new relationships.
- Is enthusiastic to take an experimental ‘trial and error’ approach, using creative and reflective methods.

The Care Home should be receptive to the proposed approach:

- Management must be supportive.
- The artist must be given access to the building and residents.
- Staff must be given permission to participate as part of their working day.

The artist should be:

- Tasked with understanding and fitting around the routine of the care setting.
- Given autonomy and allocated time to pursue creative and relationship-building tasks as they see fit.